

WRAP Exams · wrapexams.com

Prelims PYQ, Mains model answers, and copy evaluation. Write to the desk for this paper, a doubt, or the AI waitlist.

ask@wrapexams.com · +91 85951 84903 · wrapexams.com

Q8

"Max Weber said that it is not wise to apply to public administration the sort of moral and ethical norms we apply to matters of personal conscience. It is important to realize that the state bureaucracy might possess its own independent bureaucratic morality." Critically analyse this statement.

UPSC Civil Services Mains 2016 · GS IV · 12 marks · Ethics in Public Administration

Public / Civil service values and Ethics in Public administration: Status and problems; ethical concerns and dilemmas in government and private institutions; laws, rules, regulations and conscience as sources of ethical guidance; accountability and ethical governance; strengthening of ethical and moral values in governance; ethical issues in international relations and funding; corporate governance.

Core demand of the question

- "Max Weber said that it is not wise to apply to public administration the sort of moral and ethical norms we apply to matters of personal conscience. It is important to realize that the state bureaucracy might possess its own independent bureaucratic morality." Critically analyse this statement

Revision summary

Weber argued that personal conscience (kin, creed, raw pity) is a bad operating system for a bureau.

Bureaucratic morality means legality, hierarchy, documents, expertise and impersonality.

That core protects equality and professionalism.

- **The danger is an iron cage:** procedure that obeys illegal or inhuman commands and humiliates the citizen.

Indian ethics keeps Weber against nepotism and adds constitutional morality, recorded dissent and non-cruelty.

Introduction

Weber is warning that a bureau is not a family and not a church. Personal conscience - kinship, pity, a private creed - can wreck equal rule. He also claims a distinct bureaucratic morality: legality, hierarchy, files and impersonality. The statement is half a shield for professionalism and half a risk of a morality that forgets the person.

Body**What Weber is defending**

- Modern bureaucracy, in Weber's ideal type, is rule-bound, hierarchical, documentary, expert, and impersonal.
- **Personal conscience often means:** help my cousin, follow my guru, spare the tearful contractor, or sabotage a policy I dislike.

- Applied law to administration, that conscience becomes nepotism, communal capture, or a saint who cannot implement a lawful tax.
- **Bureaucratic morality in this sense is vocation (Beruf):** loyalty to the office, confidentiality, political neutrality, and the same section for every applicant.
- That is close to what India later wrote as Conduct Rules, speaking orders, and **Article 14** equality.
- **Weber** also separated the **ethic of conviction** from the **ethic of responsibility**: a politician or an officer must own consequences, not only a pure heart.

Where the statement is right

- A passport desk that applies a private religious test has failed bureaucratic morality and **constitutional morality** together.
- A judge or a collector who decides by midnight prayer without a statute has left the republic.
- Large States need impersonality so that millions are not hostages of one official's mood.
- "Independent" bureaucratic morality can mean professional standards that even a minister cannot casually override: accounts, natural justice, and the file.

Where the statement is dangerous

- If bureaucratic morality means "the organisation is always right", it becomes Eichmann's file-and-obey problem: legality without a human remainder.
- Personal conscience, properly understood, is not nepotism. It is the courage to refuse an illegal order, to leak nothing, and to record dissent - the opposite of kin ethics.
- **Gandhi**, King and civil servants who refused emergency excesses used conscience against a bureau that called itself moral because it was tidy.
- **Impersonality can become humiliation**: the petitioner as a number, delay as a weapon, and "not in the rules" as a lie when discretion exists.
- **Weber** himself feared the **iron cage**. An independent bureaucratic morality that answers only to hierarchy is not ethics; it is a closed shop.
- Indian **constitutional morality** (**Ambedkar**) binds the bureau to liberty, equality and dignity, which are not merely German office virtues of 1920.

A critical synthesis for Indian public service

- **Keep Weber's useful core**: no kin, no party, no private creed as a substitute for the section.
- Reject **Weber** if he is read as "leave your conscience at the door". The door must keep illegal and inhuman orders out.
- **Bureaucratic morality should be**: legality, impersonality, expertise, plus the constitutional and professional duty to prevent grave harm and to speak on the file.
- Personal morality of gifts, truth-telling and non-cruelty still applies; it is not a separate universe.
- Example: refusing a minister's oral order to cook a caste-biased list is both bureaucratic (ask for writing, cite the rule) and personal conscience.
- Example: a "humane" officer who skips tender law for a favourite NGO has used personal warmth to kill bureaucratic morality.

Verdict

- The statement is wise against the family-and-faction capture of the State.
- It is unwise if it creates a priesthood of procedure that cannot see a starving person or an illegal command.

- **The living ethic is Weber plus the Constitution:** impersonality without inhumanity, and conscience without nepotism.

Flow diagram

Weber -> Impersonal legality
Impersonal legality -> Blocks nepotism and faction
Impersonal legality -> Iron cage and blind obedience
Constitutional conscience -> Dissent on file
Blocks nepotism and faction -> Weber plus Constitution
Dissent on file -> Weber plus Constitution

Conclusion

Weber is right that public administration cannot run on private kin-and-creed conscience. He is wrong if bureaucratic morality means a closed, soulless legality. Indian service needs impersonality, the file, and a conscience that refuses illegal and cruel orders while still applying the same rule to the stranger.

Facts & figures

Max Weber, bureaucracy as ideal type

Rule-bound, hierarchical, documentary, expert, impersonal administration as the mark of modern officialdom.

Ethic of responsibility versus ethic of conviction

Weber's distinction: owning consequences of power, not only the purity of one's inner motive.

Iron cage

Weber's fear that rational organisation can trap people in soulless procedure.

Constitutional morality (Ambedkar)

The Indian corrective: the bureau is bound to constitutional values, not only to hierarchical propriety.

All India Services (Conduct) Rules, 1968

A local statement of bureaucratic morality: neutrality, integrity, and no private political shop in the office.

WRAP Exams · Write. Read. Analyse. Practice. · <https://wrapexams.com/upsc/mains-answers/gs-4/2016/max-weber-said-that-it-is-not-wise-to-apply-to-public-administration-the-sort-of-moral-and-ethical-norms-we-apply-to-matters-of-personal-conscience-it-is-important-to-realize-that-the-state-bureaucracy-might-possess-its/> · ask@wrapexams.com · wrapexams.com