

WRAP Exams · wrapexams.com

Prelims PYQ, Mains model answers, and copy evaluation. Write to the desk for this paper, a doubt, or the AI waitlist.

ask@wrapexams.com · +91 85951 84903 · wrapexams.com

Q20

Critically analyse the proposition that there is a high correlation between India's cultural diversities and socio-economic marginalities.

UPSC Civil Services Mains 2024 · GS I · 15 marks · World's Physical Geography

Salient features of world's physical geography.

Core demand of the question

- State the proposition that India's cultural diversities correlate strongly with socio-economic marginalities
- Critically analyse how far that correlation holds

Revision summary

The proposition claims a high correlation between cultural diversity and socio-economic marginality in India.

Tribal forest belts, some Muslim urban clusters, and certain frontiers show a real overlap.

Causation runs largely through land, stigma, connectivity, and the colonial-modern state, not through culture as such.

Counter-examples include high-development southern States and poverty in culturally core plains districts.

Diversity is a constitutional good. Disparity is the injustice.

Treat the overlap as a warning for inclusive policy. Do not treat it as a law that pluralism causes poverty.

Introduction

Some writers claim that India's cultural diversity is closely linked with socio-economic disadvantage. They lay the map of languages, tribes, faiths, and regions over the map of poverty as if culture itself caused poverty. There is a visible overlap. Many Adivasi belts, some Muslim concentrations after the **Sachar** report, and parts of the Northeast and rainfed interior are both culturally distinct and economically squeezed. A high correlation as a law of the land does not survive a hard look. Kerala's social development, Tamil social justice plus industry, and poor districts in culturally mainstream plains show that the claimed law does not hold everywhere.

Body**Where the correlation seems high**

Scheduled Tribes in central Indian forests are culturally distinct and, as groups, have worse health, land, and schooling outcomes. **Fifth Schedule** areas show that the Constitution itself linked cultural vulnerability to economic predation through land alienation and mines.

Muslims in many urban clusters face education and credit gaps that Sachar documented. This is a religious-cultural minority with socio-economic lag. It is not because Islam is anti-market. It is because of history, discrimination, and occupational lock-in. Hill and border cultures paid a connectivity tax. Dalit difference is not regional culture in the tourist sense, yet caste is a cultural system with harsh economic effects.

If one draws a crude GIS of not the dominant caste-Hindu plains culture and below-average HDI, the eye finds overlap. That overlap is the proposition's limited truth.

- **Adivasi belts:** Culture and resource dispossession often travel together.
- **Minority localities:** Identity and labour-market closure often travel together.
- **Frontiers:** Distance and security regimes often travel with cultural difference.

Where the proposition fails

Diversity is not destiny. The south is linguistically diverse and several States lead on human development. Punjab's distinct culture sat with agrarian surplus and its own inequalities. Coastal communities with strong identities have used ports and Gulf migration. Conversely, eastern Uttar Pradesh and parts of the Hindi belt can be described as culturally core in nationalist rhetoric and still show deep poverty. Elite minorities, including some trading diasporas, are culturally marked and rich. Gender cuts every culture. A dominant-caste woman may be culturally inside and still property-poor.

The causal arrow often runs from political economy to culture's fate. Who was conquered, whose land was surveyed, who got the canal, and who was labelled criminal or backward matter more. Culture then marks the losers. It does not create the loss by itself. A high-correlation thesis that blames diversity for marginality is one step from saying pluralism is the problem. The Constitution rejects that claim.

- **Counter-examples:** There is high diversity with high development. There is also low exotic diversity with high poverty.
- **Causation:** State, market, and stigma allocate irrigation and schools. Folk culture does not.
- **Risk of the thesis:** Cultural stereotyping becomes development policy.

Critical verdict

There is a moderate, historically produced association between some cultural margins and socio-economic margins. There is not a tight scientific law that more diversity means more poverty. Policy should protect diversity through language, Schedule areas, and minority rights. It should attack disparity through land, schools, anti-discrimination, and connectivity. Mixing the two into one correlation is bad geography and worse ethics.

The proposition is useful as a warning against ignoring identity in poverty data. It is dangerous as a theory of Indian underdevelopment.

Flow diagram

History of incorporation -> Some overlap culture and poverty
 Land mines discrimination -> Some overlap culture and poverty
 Southern HD and rich minorities -> Correlation is not a law
 Poor Hindi-belt districts -> Correlation is not a law
 Some overlap culture and poverty -> Critical: association not destiny

Conclusion

Cultural diversity and socio-economic marginality overlap in tribal belts, some minority neighbourhoods, and neglected frontiers. They do not move together across all of India. The Republic's task is to separate them. Diversity should be kept. The development gap should be closed. That is federalism plus **Article 15**. It is not a complaint that India has too many cultures.

Facts & figures

Sachar Committee, 2006

Documented socio-economic and educational lags among many Indian Muslims, an identity-outcome overlap that discrimination and occupation help explain.

Fifth Schedule

Constitutional recognition that tribal areas need special land and governance protection against dispossession.

ST development indicators

Official health and education statistics have long shown Scheduled Tribes as a group lagging national averages, alongside cultural distinctness.

Southern human development

Several linguistically distinct southern States rank high on literacy and health, breaking any simple diversity-poverty law.

Articles 15, 29, 30

Bar discrimination and protect cultural rights - the legal refusal to treat diversity as a legitimate reason for exclusion.

WRAP Exams · Write. Read. Analyse. Practice. · <https://wrapexams.com/upsc/mains-answers/gs-1/2024/critically-analyse-the-proposition-that-there-is-a-high-correlation-between-indias-cultural-diversities-and-socio-economic-marginalities/> · ask@wrapexams.com · wrapexams.com